



July 26, 2018

To: **Propel Engineering, Inc.**  
**Arcadis U.S., Inc.**  
**Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.**

Subj: **Wednesday, July 25, 2018, Selection Committee Results**  
**Lyons Rd., N. o LWDD L-30 Canal to Boynton Beach Blvd.**  
**Estimated 3.0 Miles, 4 Lane Roadway**  
**Project No. 2018503**

**Department of Engineering  
and Public Works**

P.O. Box 21229  
West Palm Beach, FL 33416-1229  
(561) 684-4000  
FAX: (561) 684-4050  
www.pbcgov.com



**Palm Beach County  
Board of County  
Commissioners**

Melissa McKinlay, Mayor  
Mack Bernard, Vice Mayor

Hal R. Valeche  
Paulette Burdick  
Dave Kerner  
Steven L. Abrams  
Mary Lou Berger

**County Administrator**

Verdenia C. Baker

Dear Consultants:

This letter serves to advise you of the results of the July 25, 2018, Selection Committee for the above referenced project. The firm that has been selected is: **Propel Engineering, Inc.**

**Consultants are hereby notified of the "Cone of Silence" requirements pursuant to Palm Beach County Lobbyist Registration Ordinance 2003-055.**

In accordance with Palm Beach County PPM #CW-O-048, the results of the Selection Committee meeting shall be reported in writing to the Board of County Commissioners (Board). If any member of the Board has not requested to review the ranking of the Selection Committee Meeting within ten (10) business days of such report, it shall be deemed that the Board has affirmed the selection. The selected firm will be contacted to schedule a scope of services meeting and begin negotiations.

Thank you for your time in presenting your approach for this project. We encourage you to submit on future projects. Should you have any questions or require additional information please contact me at 561-684-4122 or at [hknight@pbcgov.org](mailto:hknight@pbcgov.org).

Sincerely,



---

Holly B. Knight, P.E.

Contracts Section Manager

"An Equal Opportunity  
Affirmative Action Employer"



July 26, 2018

Wednesday, July 25, 2018, Selection Committee Results  
Lyons Rd., N. o LWDD L-30 Canal to Boynton Beach Blvd.  
Estimated 3.0 Miles, 4 Lane Roadway  
Project No. 2018503

pc: Tanya N. McConnell, P.E., Deputy County Engineer

ec: David Ricks, P.E., County Engineer  
Steve Carrier, P.E. Assistant County Engineer  
Omelio A. Fernandez, P.E., Director, Roadway Production  
Morton Rose, P.E., Assistant Director, Roadway Production  
Kathleen Farrell, P.E., Thoroughfare Roads Section Manager,  
Roadway Production  
Holly Knight, P.E., Contracts Section Manager, Roadway Production  
Basher Khan, P.E., Project Engineer, Roadway Production  
JaeAnn Dean, Technical Assistant II, Roadway Production  
Selection Committee Members  
CCNA File

**MINUTES OF SELECTION COMMITTEE**

**MEETING** Wednesday, July 25, 2018

Commencing: 1:37 p.m., Ending: 4:10 p.m.

Vista Center, 2300 N. Jog Road, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor

Confernece Room (Room #3W-12)

**MEMBERS PRESENT:**

David Ricks, P.E.	- County Engineer
Steve Carrier, P.E.	- Assistant County Engineer
Tanoy Williams	- Contracts Analyst, Contract Development & Control
Kathleen Farrell, P.E.	- Thoroughfare Roads Manager, Roadway Production
Angela Smith	- Small Business Assistance Manager
Basher Khan, P.E.	- Project Engineer, Roadway Production

Delegated Votes:

* David Ricks, P.E.	- County Administrator
* Steve Carrier, P.E.	- County Engineer
* Tanoy Williams	- Director, Contract Development & Control
* Kathleen Farrell, P.E.	- Director, Roadway Production
* Angela Smith	- Director, Office of Small Business Assistance

(\* Denotes a delegate for a committee member.)

**DISCUSSION:**

The Selection Committee was called to order by Steve Carrier, P.E., Assistant County Engineer. It was stated that the committee would be selecting a firm for Professional Engineering Consulting Services for:

**Lyons Rd., N. of LWDD L-30 Canal to Boynton Beach Blvd.**

**Estimated 3.0 Miles, 4 Lane Roadway**

**Project No. 2018503**

The meeting was opened up the meeting for Public Comments, none were present.

Opening discussion identifying and outlining the project requirements was given by Kathleen Farrell, P.E., Thoroughfare Roads Section Manager. The outline stated what the work entailed, and what the committee should be looking for in the presentations by the firms.

The order of business was to select one consultant. Each was invited to make a presentation of their qualifications before the Selection Committee.

Prior to voting, it was noted that the fees considered report used to determine volume of previous

work points was missing a new project for Stantec. The committee voted to adjust the fees considered accordingly which resulted in a score of 7 for the Stantec team in this category. Voting sheets were adjusted.

**RESULTS:**

The Selection Committee voting resulted in the following ranking order of the consulting firms:

1. **Propel Engineering, Inc.**
2. **Arcadis U.S., Inc.**
3. **Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.**

At the end of the Presentations Steve Carrier, P.E., Assistant County Engineer stated that the Public is welcome to make comments or sit and observe the discussions. None chose to speak.

# SELECTION COMMITTEE TALLY SHEET

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE: **All Engineering Services Required for:**

**Lyons Rd., N. of LWDD L-30 Canal to Boynton Beach Blvd.**

PROJECT NO: **2018503**

MEETING DATE: **Wednesday, July 25, 2018**

MEETING TIME: **1:30 P.M.**

Selection Committee		Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.	Propel Engineering, Inc.	Arcadis U.S., Inc.
County Engineer	* Steve Carrier	3	2	1
County Administrator	* David Ricks	3	1	2
Director of Water Utilities	<i>Absent</i>			
Director of Contracts Development & Control	* Tanoy Williams	3	1	2
Director of Roadway	* Kathleen Farrell	3	2	1
Director of OSBA	* Angela Smith	3	1	2
Project Manager	Basher Khan	3	1	2
<b>Total</b>		<b>18</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>Rank</b>		<b>3</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>

\* - Denotes a delegate for a committee member

JaeAnn Dean

Secretary's Printed Name

Secretary's Signature

# SELECTION COMMITTEE EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE: **All Engineering Services Required for:  
Lyons Rd., N. of LWDD L-30 Canal to  
Boynton Beach Blvd.  
estimated 3.0 miles, 4 lane roadway**

PROJECT NO: **2018503**

SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING DATE: **Wednesday, July 25, 2018**

SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING TIME: **1:30 P.M.**

Criteria	Max Score	Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.	Propel Engineering, Inc.	Arcadis U.S., Inc
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the technical requirements of the project.	50	49	45	50
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of presentation, including meeting time/budget requirements.	20	19	19	20
<b>Subtotal</b>	70			
Location of the firm's offices and where work will be accomplished	10	10	10	10
SBE/MWBE Participation	10	8	10	8
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past four (4) years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	7 <sup>sc</sup> 9 <sup>sc</sup>	10	8
<b>Subtotal</b>	30	25 <sup>sc</sup> 27 <sup>sc</sup>	30	26
<b>Total</b>		93	94	96
<b>Rank</b>		3	2	1

Member's Name: **Steve Carrier**

Member's Signature: 

7/25/18

## SELECTION COMMITTEE EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE: **All Engineering Services Required for:  
Lyons Rd., N. of LWDD L-30 Canal to  
Boynton Beach Blvd.  
estimated 3.0 miles, 4 lane roadway**

PROJECT NO: **2018503**

SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING DATE: **Wednesday, July 25, 2018**

SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING TIME: **1:30 P.M.**

Criteria	Max Score	Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.	Propel Engineering, Inc.	Arcadis U.S., Inc
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the technical requirements of the project.	50	47	49	48
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of presentation, including meeting time/budget requirements.	20	19	18	19
<b>Subtotal</b>	70			
Location of the firm's offices and where work will be accomplished	10	10	10	10
SBE/MWBE Participation	10	8	10	8
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past four (4) years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	27 <sup>21</sup>	10	8
<b>Subtotal</b>	30	25 <sup>21</sup>	30	26
<b>Total</b>		91	97	93
<b>Rank</b>		3	1	2

Member's Name: **DAVID RICKS**

Member's Signature: 

## SELECTION COMMITTEE EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE: **All Engineering Services Required for:**

**Lyons Rd., N. of LWDD L-30 Canal to**

**Boynton Beach Blvd.**

**estimated 3.0 miles, 4 lane roadway**

PROJECT NO: **2018503**

SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING DATE: **Wednesday, July 25, 2018**

SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING TIME: **1:30 P.M.**

Criteria	Max Score	Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.	Propel Engineering, Inc.	Arcadis U.S., Inc
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the technical requirements of the project.	50	45	45	45
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of presentation, including meeting time/budget requirements.	20	17	17	18
<b>Subtotal</b>	70	62	62	63
Location of the firm's offices and where work will be accomplished	10	10	10	10
SBE/MWBE Participation	10	8	10	8
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past four (4) years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	27	10	8
<b>Subtotal</b>	30	27	30	26
<b>Total</b>		89	92	89
<b>Rank</b>		3	1	2

Member's Name:

Troy Williams

Member's Signature

Troy Williams

## SELECTION COMMITTEE EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE: **All Engineering Services Required for:  
Lyons Rd., N. of LWDD L-30 Canal to  
Boynton Beach Blvd.  
estimated 3.0 miles, 4 lane roadway**

PROJECT NO: **2018503**

SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING DATE: **Wednesday, July 25, 2018**

SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING TIME: **1:30 P.M.**

Criteria	Max Score	Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.	Propel Engineering, Inc.	Arcadis U.S., Inc
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the technical requirements of the project.	50	47	44	50
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of presentation, including meeting time/budget requirements.	20	19	18	20
<b>Subtotal</b>	70			
Location of the firm's offices and where work will be accomplished	10	10	10	10
SBE/MWBE Participation	10	8	10	8
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past four (4) years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	9 <sup>7</sup> <sup>KCF</sup>	10	8
<b>Subtotal</b>	30	KCF 27 25	30	26
<b>Total</b>		91	92	96
<b>Rank</b>		3	2	1

Member's Name: **Kathleen O. Farrell**

Member's Signature: *Kath O Farrell*

## SELECTION COMMITTEE EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE: **All Engineering Services Required for:**  
**Lyons Rd., N. of LWDD L-30 Canal to**  
**Boynton Beach Blvd.**  
**estimated 3.0 miles, 4 lane roadway**

PROJECT NO: **2018503**

SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING DATE: **Wednesday, July 25, 2018**

SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING TIME: **1:30 P.M.**

Criteria	Max Score	Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.	Propel Engineering, Inc.	Arcadis U.S., Inc
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the technical requirements of the project.	50	48	48	49
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of presentation, including meeting time/budget requirements.	20	18	19	18
<b>Subtotal</b>	70	66	67	67
Location of the firm's offices and where work will be accomplished	10	10	10	10
SBE/MWBE Participation	10	8	10	8
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past four (4) years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	7 <sup>th</sup> 9	10	8
<b>Subtotal</b>	30	27 <sup>th</sup> 25 <sup>th</sup>	30	26
<b>Total</b>		91	97	93
<b>Rank</b>		3	1	2

Member's Name: **Angela Smith**

Member's Signature: 

## SELECTION COMMITTEE EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE: **All Engineering Services Required for:**

**Lyons Rd., N. of LWDD L-30 Canal to**

**Boynton Beach Blvd.**

**estimated 3.0 miles, 4 lane roadway**

PROJECT NO: **2018503**

SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING DATE: **Wednesday, July 25, 2018**

SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING TIME: **1:30 P.M.**

Criteria	Max Score	Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.	Propel Engineering, Inc.	Arcadis U.S., Inc
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the technical requirements of the project.	50	50	50	50
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of presentation, including meeting time/budget requirements.	20	18	20	19
<b>Subtotal</b>	70			
Location of the firm's offices and where work will be accomplished	10	10	10	10
SBE/MWBE Participation	10	8	10	8
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past four (4) years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	<del>7</del> 9	10	8
<b>Subtotal</b>	30	<del>25</del> 27	30	26
<b>Total</b>		93	100	95
<b>Rank</b>		3	1	2

Member's Name:

*Basher Khan*

Member's Signature

*[Handwritten Signature]*

**COMPILATION OF SELECTION COMMITTEE VOTING BALLOTS**

**DATE** Wednesday, July 25, 2018

**PROJECT** All Engineering Services Required for:

Lyons Rd., N. of LWDD L-30 Canal to Boynton Beach Blvd

**PROJECT NO:** 2018503

<b>CRITERIA:</b>			
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the technical requirements of the project.			
<b>MAX SCORE</b>		35	
<b>Selection Committee</b>	<b>Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.</b>	<b>Propel Engineering Inc.</b>	<b>Arcadis U.S., Inc</b>
Steve Carrier	49	45	50
David Ricks	47	49	48
Tanoy Williams	45	45	45
Kathleen Farrell	47	44	50
Angela Smith	48	48	49
Basher Khan	50	50	50

<b>CRITERIA:</b>			
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of presentation, including meeting time/budget requirements.			
<b>MAX SCORE</b>		35	
<b>Selection Committee</b>	<b>Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.</b>	<b>Propel Engineering Inc.</b>	<b>Arcadis U.S., Inc</b>
Steve Carrier	19	19	20
David Ricks	19	18	19
Tanoy Williams	17	17	18
Kathleen Farrell	19	18	20
Angela Smith	18	19	18
Basher Khan	18	20	19

<b>CRITERIA:</b>			
Location of the firm's offices and where work will be accomplished			
<b>MAX SCORE</b>		10	
<b>Selection Committee</b>	<b>Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.</b>	<b>Propel Engineering Inc.</b>	<b>Arcadis U.S., Inc</b>
Steve Carrier	10	10	10
David Ricks	10	10	10
Tanoy Williams	10	10	10
Kathleen Farrell	10	10	10
Angela Smith	10	10	10
Basher Khan	10	10	10

**COMPILATION OF SELECTION COMMITTEE VOTING BALLOTS**

DATE Wednesday, July 25, 2018

PROJECT All Engineering Services Required for:  
Lyons Rd., N. of LWDD L-30 Canal to Boynton Beach Blvd  
PROJECT NO: 2018503

**CRITERIA:**  
SBE/MWBE Participation

**MAX SCORE** 10

Selection Committee	Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.	Propel Engineering Inc.	Arcadis U.S., Inc
Steve Carrier	8	10	8
David Ricks	8	10	8
Tanoy Williams	8	10	8
Kathleen Farrell	8	10	8
Angela Smith	8	10	8
Basher Khan	8	10	8

**CRITERIA:**  
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past four (4) years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)

**MAX SCORE** 10

Selection Committee	Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.	Propel Engineering Inc.	Arcadis U.S., Inc
Steve Carrier	7	10	8
David Ricks	7	10	8
Tanoy Williams	7	10	8
Kathleen Farrell	7	10	8
Angela Smith	7	10	8
Basher Khan	7	10	8

**TOTALS / RANKINGS**  
Total points from each voting member and associated rank of firm.

Selection Committee	Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.	Propel Engineering Inc.	Arcadis U.S., Inc
Steve Carrier	93 3	94 2	96 1
David Ricks	91 3	97 1	93 2
Tanoy Williams	87 3	92 1	89 2
Kathleen Farrell	91 3	92 2	96 1
Angela Smith	91 3	97 1	93 2
Basher Khan	93 3	100 1	95 2
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>18</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>RANK</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>

JaeAnn Dean  
Secretary Name Printed

  
Secretary Signature  


## SELECTION COMMITTEE CONSULTANT SUMMARY

**One Firm to Provide:** Professional Engineering Consulting Services for  
Lyons Rd., N. of LWDD L-30 Canal to Boynton Beach Blvd.  
estimated 3.0 miles, 4 lane roadway

**Project No:** 2018503

**Meeting Date:** Wednesday, July 25, 2018

**Meeting Time:** 1:30 P.M.

TEAM				LOCATION		SBE & M/WBE			VOLUME OF PREVIOUS WORK (\$)		
Team Members	Services Provided	% Work on Project	Notes	% Work in PBC	Points	SBE	M/WBE (Non-black)	Points	Fee Considered	Pro-Rated Fee	Points
<b>Arcadis U.S., Inc.</b>	3.02	74%	1	74%	<b>10</b>				\$398,666	\$293,020	<b>8</b>
Brown & Phillips, Inc.	5.02	14%		14%		13.5		13.5	\$646,951	\$87,338	
EW Consultants, Inc.	1.07	2%		2%		2.0			\$8,731	\$175	
McMahon Associates, Inc.	3.02	5%	1	5%					\$66,987	\$3,349	
Tierra South Florida, Inc.	6.01	6%		6%			6.0		\$779,211	\$46,753	
		<b>100%</b>		<b>100%</b>		15.5%	6%	13.5%			
					4	1	3				
						<b>4</b>					
<b>Propel Engineering, Inc.</b>	3.02	80%	1	80%	<b>10</b>	80.0	80.0		910478 \$0	118362 \$0	<b>10</b>
Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.	3.02, 5.02	13%	1	13%					<del>\$545,291</del>	<del>\$70,888</del>	
GCME, Inc.	6.01	5%		5%		5.0	5.0		\$32,994	\$1,650	
Baron Worth Advisors, Inc.	1.07	2%		2%		2.0	2.0		\$0	\$0	
		<b>100%</b>		<b>100%</b>		87%	87%	0%			
						10	5	0			
						<b>5</b>					
<b>Stantec Consulting Services, Inc.</b>	3.02, 3.06	60%	1	60%	<b>10</b>				910478	546287	<b>8</b>
American Consulting Engineers of Florida, LLC.	3.02	10%	1	10%					<del>\$545,291</del>	<del>\$327,175</del>	
GCME, Inc.	6.01	5%		5%		5.0	5.0		\$32,994	\$1,650	
Manuel G. Vera & Associates, Inc.	5.02	10%		10%		10.0	10.0		\$0	\$0	
Propel Engineering, Inc.	3.06 - <i>unrequested service</i>	10%	1, 2	10%		10.0	10.0		\$0	\$0	
Baron Worth Advisors, Inc.	1.07	5%		5%		5.0	5.0		\$0	\$0	
		<b>100%</b>		<b>100%</b>	30%	30%	0%			<del>\$394,188</del> 613300	
					5	3	0				
						<b>3</b>					

## SELECTION COMMITTEE CONSULTANT SUMMARY

**One Firm to Provide:** Professional Engineering Consulting Services for  
Lyons Rd., N. of LWDD L-30 Canal to Boynton Beach Blvd.  
estimated 3.0 miles, 4 lane roadway

**Project No:** 2018503

**Meeting Date:** Wednesday, July 25, 2018

**Meeting Time:** 1:30 P.M.

TEAM				LOCATION		SBE & M/WBE			VOLUME OF PREVIOUS WORK (\$)			
Team Members	Services Provided	% Work on Project	Notes	% Work in PBC	Points	SBE	M/WBE (Non-black)	M/WBE (Black)	Points	Fee Considered	Pro-Rated Fee	Points
<u>Prime Categories</u>		<u>Subcategories</u>		<u>Notes</u>								
3.02 (General Hwy. Design w/Curb & Gutter, Access & Drainage)		1.07 (Environmental Studies)		* - Pro Rated Fee = Previous Work Amount multiplied by the % of work on the project 1- Prime and Sub on different teams 2 - Unrequested Service								
		5.02 (Engineering Surveying)										
		6.01 (Gelological & Geographic Studies)										

**SELECTION COMMITTEE MEETING**

**Palm Beach County Engineering Department**

One (1) Firm - to provide all engineering services required for the preparation of plans and specifications complete for formal advertising and receipt of bids for:

**Lyons Rd., N. of LWDD L-30 Canal to Boynton Beach Blvd.  
Estimated 3.0 Miles, 4 Lane Roadway  
Project No. 2018503**

**July 25, 2018**

Name	Organization	Phone	Email
Angela Smith	OSBA	561-616-6852	@smith1@pbcgov.org
Kathleen Farrell	PBC Rdwy Production	(561) 684-4150	kfarrelle@pbcgov.org
LIZ Herman	CAO	355-3965	lherman@pbcgov.org
Steve Carrio	Eng	684-4016	scarrio - - - - -
DAVID RICKS	ENG	355-3006	
Tandy Williams	DFMS/LDC	561-355-3352	twilliam@pbcgov.org
JADEAN DEAN	PBC ROADWAY	561/684-4154	jadean@pbcgov.org
Holly Knight	PBC Roadway	561-684-4150	hknight@pbcgov.org
Bashar Khan	PBC Roadway	571-684-4151	bkhan@pbcgov.org