



October 10, 2018

To: RFP Respondents

RE: One (1) firm to provide all required professional engineering services for:

**Palm Beach Lakes Blvd. over FEC Railroad
Estimated 0.3 Mile, Bridge Widening and Rehabilitation
Project No. 2017800**

Dear Consultant:

This letter serves to advise you of the results of the October 9, 2018, Short List Committee meeting for the above project. **HNTB Corporation, Stanley Consultants, Inc., Scalar Consulting Group, Inc.** were short listed.

Consultants are hereby notified of the "Cone of Silence" requirements pursuant to Palm Beach County Lobbyist Registration Ordinance 2003-055. In addition, it is recommended that all design professionals seeking to provide services to Palm Beach County review Policies and Procedures Manual (PPM) CW-F-067 "Evaluating, Recovering and Recording Errors/Omissions by a Design Professional", which can be found at www.co.palm-beach.fl.us/publicaffairs/ppm/pdf/cw-f-067.pdf

Short-listed firms may add or delete team members after the Short List Committee meeting if the Contracts Manager is notified **within five (5) business days** of this notice. If a short-listed firm makes changes to their team within the above period, the Contracts Manager will notify the other short-listed firms of such changes.

The "Consultant Summary" table and the Short List Committee voting sheets will be posted shortly at: <http://discover.pbcgov.org/engineering/roadwayproductions/Pages/Roadway-Publications.aspx>.

Thank you for your submittal and we encourage you to respond to future RFP's.

The Short Listed firms will be notified under separate cover of their presentation time. Should you have any questions or require additional information, please contact me at 561-684-4150 or email me at HKnight@pbcgov.org

Sincerely,


Holly Knight, P.E.
Contracts Section Manager

- pc: Tanya McConnell, P.E., Deputy County Engineer
- ec: Patrick Rutter, Assistant County Administrator
David L. Ricks, P.E., County Engineer
Steve Carrier, P.E., Assistant County Engineer
Omelio A. Fernandez, P.E., Director, Roadway Production
Morton Rose, P.E., Assistant Director, Roadway Production
Kathleen Farrell, P.E., Thoroughfare Roads Section Manager, Roadway Production
Fenson Masse, P.E., Project Engineer, Roadway Production
Anthony Montero, Office of the Inspector General
Yelizaveta B. Herman, Assistant County Attorney
Committee Members

N:\ROADWAY\CCNA\2017\2017800_Palm Beach Lakes over FEC RR\Short List Meeting\Short List Results_Consultants.docx

**Department of Engineering
and Public Works**
P.O. Box 21229
West Palm Beach, FL 33416-1229
(561) 684-4000
FAX: (561) 684-4050
www.pbcgov.com

**Palm Beach County
Board of County
Commissioners**

- Melissa McKinlay, Mayor
- Mack Bernard, Vice Mayor
- Hal R. Valeche
- Paulette Burdick
- Dave Kerner
- Steven L. Abrams
- Mary Lou Berger

County Administrator

Verdenia C. Baker

"An Equal Opportunity
Affirmative Action Employer"

MINUTES OF SHORT LIST COMMITTEE MEETING
 October 9, 2018, Commencing: 2:53 p.m., Ending: 4:00 p.m.
 Engineering & Public Works Department
 2300 N. Jog Road, Conference Room #3W-12

MEMBERS PRESENT:

- | | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Steve Carrier, P.E. | - Assistant County Engineer |
| Motasem Al-Turk, P.E. | - Director, Traffic |
| Joanne Keller, P.E. | - Director, Land Development |
| Kathleen Farrell, P.E.* | - 5-Yr Road Program Manager, Roadway Production |
| Mark Tomlinson | - Director, Construction Coordination |
| Fenson Masse, P.E. | - Project Manager, Roadway Production |
| Angela Smith ** | - Sm. Business Development Specialist,
Office of Small Business Assistance |

* voting for Contracts Manager

** voting for Director of Office of Small Business Assistance

DISCUSSION:

The Short List Committee was called to order by Steve Carrier, P.E., Assistant County Engineer. It was stated that the committee would be discussing the firms for Professional Engineering Consulting Services for:

**Palm Beach Lakes Blvd. over FEC Railroad
 Estimated 0.3 Mile, Bridge Widening and Rehabilitation
 Project No. 2017800**

The meeting was opened up the meeting for Public Comments, public was present but none had questions or comments. The outline of the project was discussed by Kathleen Farrell, P.E., 5-Year Road Program Manager. The committee voted to allow 6% local work for HDR's subconsultant Aviom because their subconsultant questionnaire showed 0% outside the county work despite their mistaken total work amount of 5% shown.

RESULTS:

Submitting Firms		Shortlisted Firms	
1	HDR Engineering	1	HNTB Corporation
2	HNTB Corporation	1	Stanley Consultants, Inc.
3	Infrastructure Engineers	3	Scalar Consulting Group, Inc.
4	Scalar Consulting Group, Inc.		
5	Stanley Consultants, Inc.		
6	Wantman Group, Inc.		

SHORTLIST CONSULTANT SUMMARY

One Firm to Provide: Professional Engineering Consulting Services for
 Palm Beach Lakes Blvd. over FEC Railroad
 estimated 0.3 mile, Bridge Widening and Rehabilitation

Project No: 2017800

Meeting Date: 9-Oct-18
Meeting Time: 2:30 p.m.

TEAM				LOCATION		SBE & M/WBE			VOLUME OF PREVIOUS WORK (\$)			
Team Members	Services Provided	% Work on Project	Notes	% Work in PBC	Points	SBE	M/WBE (Non-black)	M/WBE (Black)	Points	Fee Considered	Pro-Rated Fee	Points
HDR Engineering, Inc.	3.02, 4.02	59%		37%	8				8	\$465,272	\$274,510.48	8
Alan Gerwig & Associates, Inc.	4.02	30%		30%		30.0				\$926,838	\$278,051.40	
Avirom & Associates, Inc.	5.01, 5.02	6%		6%		6.0				\$0	\$0.00	
RADISE International, LC	6.01	5%		5%		5.0	5.0			\$449,814	\$22,490.70	
		100%		78%		41.0%	5%	0.0%			\$575,053	
					7	1	0	1				
HNTB Corporation	3.02, 4.02	63.5%		59%	10				10	\$0	\$0.00	9
Brown & Phillips, Inc.	5.01, 5.02	15%		15%		15.0		15.0		\$795,015	\$119,252.25	
K-F Group, Inc.	3.02	15%		15%		15.0	15.0			\$1,455,361	\$218,304.15	
RADISE International, LC	6.01	6.5%		6.5%		6.5	6.5			\$449,814	\$29,237.91	
		100%		96%		36.5%	21.5%	15.0%			\$366,794	
					6	2	3	5				
Infrastructure Engineers, LLC	3.02, 4.02	50%		20%	6				10	\$0	\$0.00	9
Brown & Phillips, Inc.	5.01, 5.02	13.5%		13.5%		13.5		13.5		\$795,015	\$107,327.03	
RADISE International, LC	6.01	6.5%		6.5%		6.5	6.5			\$449,814	\$29,237.91	
Scalar Consulting Group, Inc.	3.02, 4.02	30%	1	30%		30.0				\$744,451	\$223,335.30	
		100%		70%		50.0%	6.5%	13.5%			\$359,900	
					7	1	3	4				

SHORTLIST CONSULTANT SUMMARY

One Firm to Provide: Professional Engineering Consulting Services for
 Palm Beach Lakes Blvd. over FEC Railroad
 estimated 0.3 mile, Bridge Widening and Rehabilitation

Project No: 2017800

Meeting Date: 9-Oct-18

Meeting Time: 2:30 p.m.

TEAM				LOCATION		SBE & M/WBE			VOLUME OF PREVIOUS WORK (\$)			
Team Members	Services Provided	% Work on Project	Notes	% Work in PBC	Points	SBE	(Non-black)	(Black)	Points	Fee Considered	Pro-Rated Fee	Points
Scalar Consulting Group, Inc.	3.02, 4.02	70%	1	67%	10	70.0			10	\$744,451	\$521,115.70	7
Propel Engineering, Inc.	3.02	10%		10%		10.0	10.0			\$196,806	\$19,680.60	
Engenuity Group, Inc.	5.01, 5.02	12%		12%		12.0	12.0			\$268,153	\$32,178.36	
Tierra South Florida, Inc.	6.01	8%		8%			8.0			\$889,270	\$71,141.60	
		100%		97%		92.0%	30%	0.0%			\$644,116	
					10	3	0	3				
Stanley Consultants, Inc.	3.02, 4.02	61%		61%	10				10	\$553,471	\$337,617.31	8
R.J. Behar & Company, Inc.	3.02, 4.02	18%		15%			18.0			\$419,646	\$75,536.28	
RADISE International, LC	6.01	10%		10%		10.0	10.0			\$449,814	\$44,981.40	
Brown & Phillips, Inc.	5.01, 5.02	11%		11%		11.0		11.0		\$795,015	\$87,451.65	
		100%		97%		21.0%	28%	11.0%			\$545,587	
					5	3	2	5				
Wantman Group, Inc.	3.02, 4.02, 5.01, 5.02	58%		58%	10				10	\$1,307,861	\$758,559.38	6
HSQ Group, Inc.	5.01, 5.02	10%		10%		10.0	10.0			\$1,827,403	\$182,740.30	
Propel Engineering, Inc.	3.02	20%		20%		20.0	20.0			\$196,806	\$39,361.20	
RADISE International, LC	6.01	12%		12%		12.0	12.0			\$449,814	\$53,977.68	
		100%		100%		42.0%	42%	0.0%			\$1,034,639	
					7	4	0	4				
<u>Prime Categories</u>	<u>Subcategories</u>			<u>Notes</u>								
3.02 (General Hwy. Design w/Curb & Gutter, Access & Drainage)	4.02 (Major Bridges Design)			* - Pro Rated Fee = Previous Work Amount multiplied by the % of work on the project								
	5.01, 5.02 (Land & Engineering Surveying)			1- Prime and Sub on different teams								
	6.01 (Gelogical & Geographic Studies)											
	** - This project had a MANDATORY Pre-proposal meeting - All prime firms attended.											

SHORT LIST COMMITTEE TALLY SHEET

ONE (1) FIRM FOR:	All Engineering Services Required for:
	Palm Beach Lakes Blvd. over FEC Railroad
PROJECT NO:	2017800
MEETING DATE:	Tuesday, October 09, 2018
MEETING TIME:	2:30 p.m.

Shortlist Committee		HDR Engineering, Inc.	HNTB Corporation	Infrastructure Engineers, LLC	Scalar Consulting Group, Inc.	Stanley Consultants, Inc.	Wantman Group, Inc.
Assistant County Engineer	Steve Carrier	5	2	6	4	1	3
Director Roadway Production	Absent						
Director Traffic	Motasem Al-Turk	5	1	6	3	2	4
Director Land Development	Joanne Keller	4	5	6	2	1	3
Contracts Manager	* Kathleen Farrell	5	2	6	3	1	3
Director Construction Coordination	Mark Tomlinson	6	1	5	2	3	4
User Dept Representative	* Fenson Masse	5	1	6	3	2	4
Director Office of Small Business	* Angela Smith	4	3	6	1	5	2
Total		34	15	41	18	15	23
Rank		5	1	6	3	1	4

	Colleen Flanagan Secretary Printed Name	 Secretary Signature
--	---	--



SHORT LIST EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE: **All Engineering Services Required for:
Palm Beach Lakes Blvd. over FEC Railroad**

PROJECT NO: **2017800**

SHORT LIST MEETING DATE: **9-Oct-18**

SHORT LIST MEETING TIME: **2:30 p.m.**

Criteria	Max Score	HDR Engineering, Inc.	HNTB Corporation	Infrastructure Engineers, LLC	Scalar Consulting Group, Inc.	Stanley Consultants, Inc.	Wantman Group, Inc.
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the technical requirements of the project.	50	46	44	45	43	46	46
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of presentation, including meeting time/budget requirements.	20	16	17	12	17	17	16
Subtotal	70	62	61	57	60	63	62
Location of the firm's offices and where work will be accomplished	10	8 ⁷ 8 ^{se}	10	6	10	10	10
SBE/MWBE Participation	10	8	10	10	10	10	10
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past four (4) years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	8	9	9	7	8	6
Subtotal	30	24 ²³ 24 ^{se}	29	25	27	28	26
Total		86	90	82	87	91	88
Rank		5	2	6	4	1	3

Member's Name: *Steven Carrier*

Member's Signature: *St. Car* 10/9/18



SHORT LIST EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE: All Engineering Services Required for:
 Palm Beach Lakes Blvd. over FEC Railroad
 PROJECT NO: 2017800

SHORT LIST MEETING DATE: 9-Oct-18
 SHORT LIST MEETING TIME: 2:30 p.m.

Criteria	Max Score	HDR Engineering, Inc.	HNTB Corporation	Infrastructure Engineers, LLC	Scalar Consulting Group, Inc.	Stanley Consultants, Inc.	Wantman Group, Inc.
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the technical requirements of the project.	50	45	50	45	50	50	50
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of presentation, including meeting time/budget requirements.	20	18	20	15	18	18	18
Subtotal	70						
Location of the firm's offices and where work will be accomplished	10	7	10	6	10	10	10
SBE/MWBE Participation	10	8	10	10	10	10	10
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past four (4) years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	8	9	9	7	8	6
Subtotal	30	23 ^{ma} 24	29	25	27	28	26
Total		87	99	85	95	96	94
Rank		8 ^{ma} 5	1	6	3	2	4

Member's Name: Motasem Al-Turk

Member's Signature:



SHORT LIST EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE: **All Engineering Services Required for:
Palm Beach Lakes Blvd. over FEC Railroad**
PROJECT NO: **2017800**

SHORT LIST MEETING DATE: **9-Oct-18**
SHORT LIST MEETING TIME: **2:30 p.m.**

Criteria	Max Score	HDR Engineering, Inc.	HNTB Corporation	Infrastructure Engineers, LLC	Scalar Consulting Group, Inc.	Stanley Consultants, Inc.	Wantman Group, Inc.
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the technical requirements of the project.	50	50	45	35	50	50	50
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of presentation, including meeting time/budget requirements.	20	20	15	5	20	20	20
Subtotal	70						
Location of the firm's offices and where work will be accomplished	10	78 <small>qual</small>	10	6	10	10	10
SBE/MWBE Participation	10	8	10	10	10	10	10
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past four (4) years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	8	9	9	7	8	6
Subtotal	30	23 <small>qual</small>	29	25	27	28	26
Total		94	89	65	97	98	96
Rank		4	5	6	2	1	3

Member's Name: **JOANNE KELLER**

Member's Signature: *Joanne P. Keller*



SHORT LIST EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE: **All Engineering Services Required for:
Palm Beach Lakes Blvd. over FEC Railroad**
PROJECT NO: **2017800**

SHORT LIST MEETING DATE: **9-Oct-18**
SHORT LIST MEETING TIME: **2:30 p.m.**

Criteria	Max Score	HDR Engineering, Inc.	HNTB Corporation	Infrastructure Engineers, LLC	Scalar Consulting Group, Inc.	Stanley Consultants, Inc.	Wantman Group, Inc.
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the technical requirements of the project.	50	46	46	30	47	48	48
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of presentation, including meeting time/budget requirements.	20	18	20	10	20	20	20
Subtotal	70						
Location of the firm's offices and where work will be accomplished	10	KOF 78	10	6	10	10	10
SBE/MWBE Participation	10	8	10	10	10	10	10
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past four (4) years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	8	9	9	7	8	6
Subtotal	30	KOF 23-24	29	25	27	28	26
Total		88	95	65	94	96	94
Rank		5 KOF	2	6 KOF	3	1	3

Member's Name: *Kathleen O. Farrell*

Member's Signature: *Kath O. Farrell*



SHORT LIST EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE: **All Engineering Services Required for:
Palm Beach Lakes Blvd. over FEC Railroad**
PROJECT NO: **2017800**

SHORT LIST MEETING DATE: **9-Oct-18**
SHORT LIST MEETING TIME: **2:30 p.m.**

Criteria	Max Score	HDR Engineering, Inc.	HNTB Corporation	Infrastructure Engineers, LLC	Scalar Consulting Group, Inc.	Stanley Consultants, Inc.	Wantman Group, Inc.
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the technical requirements of the project.	50	41	47	45	48	47	45
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of presentation, including meeting time/budget requirements.	20	17	18	15	17	16	18
Subtotal	70	58	65	60	65	63	63
Location of the firm's offices and where work will be accomplished	10	7.8	10	6	10	10	10
SBE/MWBE Participation	10	8	10	10	10	10	10
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past four (4) years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	8	9	9	7	8	6
Subtotal	30	23.24	29	25	27	28	26
Total		82	94	85	92	91	89
Rank		6	1	5	2	3	4

Member's Name: **MARK TOMLINSON**

Member's Signature:



SHORT LIST EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE: **All Engineering Services Required for:
Palm Beach Lakes Blvd. over FEC Railroad**
PROJECT NO: **2017800**

SHORT LIST MEETING DATE: **9-Oct-18**
SHORT LIST MEETING TIME: **2:30 p.m.**

Criteria	Max Score	HDR Engineering, Inc.	HNTB Corporation	Infrastructure Engineers, LLC	Scalar Consulting Group, Inc.	Stanley Consultants, Inc.	Wantman Group, Inc.
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the technical requirements of the project.	50	41	48	35	43	45	42
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of presentation, including meeting time/budget requirements.	20	15	18	13	15	17	16
Subtotal	70	56	66	48	58	62	58
Location of the firm's offices and where work will be accomplished	10	7 ^{PM}	10	6	10	10	10
SBE/MWBE Participation	10	8	10	10	10	10	10
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past four (4) years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	8	9	9	7	8	6
Subtotal	30	23 ^{PM}	29	25	27	28	26
Total		80	95	73	85	90	84
Rank		5	1	6	3	2	4

Member's Name:

FENSON MASDE

Member's Signature:

Fenson Masde



SHORT LIST EVALUATION FORM

ONE (1) FIRM TO PROVIDE: All Engineering Services Required for:
Palm Beach Lakes Blvd. over FEC Railroad

PROJECT NO: 2017800

SHORT LIST MEETING DATE: 9-Oct-18

SHORT LIST MEETING TIME: 2:30 p.m.

Criteria	Max Score	HDR Engineering, Inc.	HNTB Corporation	Infrastructure Engineers, LLC	Scalar Consulting Group, Inc.	Stanley Consultants, Inc.	Wantman Group, Inc.
Ability, knowledge of design criteria and past performance of firm and the designated project team to satisfy the technical requirements of the project.	50	48	45	42	49	44	48
Approach to the project, understanding of the project and quality of presentation, including meeting time/budget requirements.	20	19	18	17	19	18	19
Subtotal	70	67	63	59	68	62	67
Location of the firm's offices and where work will be accomplished	10	7 ⁸	10	6	10	10	10
SBE/MWBE Participation	10	8	10	10	10	10	10
Volume of previous work awarded by the County over the past four (4) years. (The firm with the most work receives the lowest score.)	10	8	9	9	7	8	6
Subtotal	30	23 ²⁴	29	25	27	28	26
Total		91	92	84	95	90	93
Rank		4	3	6	1	5	2

Member's Name: Angela Smith

Member's Signature:

**COMMITTEE
MEMBERS**

SHORT LIST COMMITTEE MEETING

Palm Beach County Engineering Department

One (1) Firm - to provide all engineering services required for the preparation of plans and specifications complete for formal advertising and receipt of bids for:

**Palm Beach Lakes Blvd. over FEC Railroad
Estimated 0.3 mile, Bridge Widening and Rehabilitation
Project No. 2017800**

October 9, 2018

Name	Organization	Phone	Email
Holly Knight	PBC Eng	561-684-4150	hknight@pbcgov.org
Colleen Flanagan	PBC Eng	561-684-4152	cflanagan@pbcgov.org
Ferguson Masse'	PBC Eng	561-684-4073	fmasse@pbcgov.org
Angela Smith	PBC OSBA	561-616-6852	asmith1@pbcgov.org
Maek Tomlinson	PBC Const. Coord	561-684-4180	MTomlins@PBCGOV.ORG
Kathleen Farrell	PBC Roadway Prod.	(561) 684-4150	KFarrelle@pbcgov.org
JOANNE KELLER	PBC LAND DEV	561-684-4090	JKELLER@PBCGOV.ORG
Steve Carr	ENG	684-4016	scarrs - - - -
Motasem Al-Turk	PBC Traffic	684-4030	maTurka@PbcGov.org

SHORT LIST COMMITTEE MEETING**Palm Beach County Engineering Department**

One (1) Firm - to provide all engineering services required for the preparation of plans and specifications complete for formal advertising and receipt of bids for:

**Palm Beach Lakes Blvd. Over FEC Railroad
Estimated 0.3 mile, Bridge Widening and Rehabilitation
Project No. 2017800**

October 9, 2018

Name	Organization	Phone	Email
HIAN KOR	K-F Group	561-798-0605	hkor@k-fgroup.com
Al Roth	Stanley Group	561-718-1961	rothalfred@stanleygroup.com
AMAR MARCHMAN	HNTB	808-208-5906	cmarchman@hntb.com
Martin Marques	HNTB	561-847-0231	mmarques@hntb.com
Brian Rheault	W&I	521-084-2220	brian.rheault@wainc.com
Tim Deland	WGI	561-686-2220	tim.deland@wginc.com
Ellen Sespaniak	HDR	561-209-6604	ellen.Sespaniak@hdrinc.com
HUGO GUTIERREZ	HDR	561-209-6609	hugo.gutierrez@hdrinc.com
Frank Hickson	TEI	772-388-1661	fhickson@go-tei.com
JOHN CERRITA	WGI	813-307-6807	john.cerrita@wginc.com
ERIC HUSKEY	STANLEY CONSULTANTS	561-689-7444	huskeyeric@stanleygroup.com
JD WHITAKER	SCAN	561-429-5065	jwhitaker@scaninc.net
AMIN AHMED	STANLEY	561-689-7444	ahmedamin@stanleygroup.com